

**APPROVED MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF
HAMILTON COUNTY RECYCLING AND SOLID WASTE DISTRICT
POLICY COMMITTEE**

DATE: January 19, 2017

TIME: 1:30 p.m.

PLACE: Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services
250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor
Cincinnati, Ohio 45219

PRESENT: **Policy Committee Members**

Elizabeth Bruggeman, General Interest Member
Tim Ingram, Hamilton County Public Health Representative
Jeff Luehrmann, Generator Representative
Sue Magness, Largest Municipality Representative
Todd Portune, County Commissioner, Chair
Larry Riddle, Ex-Officio Member
Jeff Ritter, Township Representative
Tom Turchiano, Public Member
Lilly Witte, Student Representative

Staff

Michelle Balz, Assistant Solid Waste Manager
Holly Christmann, Director
Ali Khodadad, Operations Manager
Joy Landry, Public Relations Specialist
Jenny Lohmann, Program Specialist
Brad Miller, Assistant Director
Cher Mohring, Program Specialist
Susan Schumacher, Assistant Solid Waste Specialist, Clerk
Karli Wood, Public Relations Specialist

Others in Attendance

Damon Bauman, Cincinnati State
Michael Brown, Cincinnati State
Nee Fong Chin, Hamilton County Prosecutor's Office
Brenda Deddycoart, Cincinnati State
Chuck DeJonckheere, Hamilton County Public Health
Ann Fallon, Cincinnati State
Dean Ferrier, Rumpke
Nathan Green, Cincinnati State
Greg Kesterman, Hamilton County Public Health
Anna King, Cincinnati State
Carey McLaughlin, Cincinnati State
Jeremy Myers, Cincinnati State
Kayla Peterson, Cincinnati State
Desmond Philips, Cincinnati State
Aimee Poulin, Cincinnati State
Christine Puckett, Cincinnati State
Joshua Seniors, Cincinnati State
Cecily Simmons, Cincinnati State
Tahirah Viox, Cincinnati State
Ann Witte, Resident

1. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Portune called the meeting to order at 1:34 p.m. and welcomed everyone. Mr. Portune introduced himself and stated that he was the President of the Board of County Commissioners and the Chair of this Committee.

Mr. Portune acknowledged the Cincinnati State students. Mr. Portune thanked the students for their interest in environmental issues and stated that there was a public comment period at the end of the meeting. At that time, they could feel free to ask questions.

2. CLERK'S REPORT

A. Approval of Minutes – November 17, 2016 Policy Committee Meeting

Mr. Portune stated that the November 17 minutes have been circulated previously to members of the Committee and asked if there were any changes or edits.

Mr. Portune stated that on Page 5, last paragraph, 3rd sentence: Mr. Portune ~~stated that~~ **asked whether** there will be no bottled water handed out. Mr. Portune stated to delete "stated that" and insert "asked whether."

Mr. Portune moved amendment of the minutes as just indicated. Ms. Magness stated that she had corrections. Mr. Portune stated that he would withdraw the motion momentarily and asked Ms. Magness what the corrections were.

Ms. Magness stated that on Page 6, first paragraph, first sentence: Mr. Portune ~~started~~ **stated** the grant recipients that do not require a vote are the Flying Pig Marathon, Cincinnati Recreation Commission, Mercy Montessori Center, and St. Ursula Academy.

Mr. Portune asked if there were any other edits to the minutes. Hearing none, moved amendment to the minutes as drafted and stated here and asked for a second. Ms. Bruggeman seconded. Mr. Portune asked if there was any further discussion or comment. Hearing none, asked that all in favor indicate by saying Aye. All were in favor and the amendment was approved.

Mr. Portune asked for a motion of the adoption of the minutes as amended. Mr. Ingram moved; Ms. Bruggeman seconded. All were in favor and the amended minutes were approved.

B. Additions to the Agenda

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if there were any additions to the agenda. Ms. Christmann stated no.

3. DISTRICT REVENUE UPDATES/ANALYSIS

Mr. Portune stated that it looked as though revenues were up about a half of a million dollars. Ms. Christmann stated that compared to 2015, revenues are up about \$400,000 which is what the District expected. \$2.6 million was still being projected for 2016 although the December check had not arrived yet.

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if there were any budget decisions that have been made or short or long term decisions that have been made as a matter of policy that we might want to consider revisiting. Does the uptick in revenue give us the potential opportunity to consider something that has not been considered before? Mr. Portune stated he was not putting Ms. Christmann on the spot today but raising it as an issue perhaps for her and staff to think about and maybe give some options to the Committee at either the next or some other future meeting when she is prepared to do so.

Ms. Christmann stated that in the Plan Update, which goes into effect in 2018, plans are laid out if revenue goes above \$2.5 million. If revenue is \$2.6 million, an additional \$100,000 will be put into the Residential Recycling Incentive (RRI) program. If revenue is \$2.7 million, in addition to increasing the RRI funding, a household hazardous waste program will be conducted.

Ms. Christmann stated that those contingencies are already laid out in the Plan Update. If revenue does go above \$2.7 or \$2.8 million, then there will be flexibility to think about additional programs or expenses the District wants to incur.

Mr. Portune briefly explained to the Cincinnati State students the District's mission statement and revenue structure.

4. **POLICY ITEMS**

A. Solid Waste Management Plan Adoption

Ms. Christmann stated that she was very proud of the Plan and of the staff that worked on it and how it turned out. Ms. Christmann stated that as she has said before, this was the first time a Plan has been completed without the use of a consultant.

Ms. Christmann stated that today the Committee was being asked to adopt the Plan which means, once it is adopted, the District will go into ratification. Ratification is where the District asks all Hamilton County political jurisdictions and Board of County Commissioners to approve the Plan.

Ms. Christmann stated that there were certain requirements of whom and how many communities have to approve it and they have 90-days to approve before the Plan is then sent to Ohio EPA for final approval.

Mr. Portune gave thanks to Ms. Christmann and staff for an extraordinary job saving the people of Hamilton County a lot of money by doing this and creating a lot more capacity for us to invest in programs that promote recycling, reduction, and reuse because that money was not being spent on consultants.

Mr. Portune stated that we would then entertain a motion to approve. Mr. Ingram stated that staff did a great job and saved a lot of money which is money that will go back into the hands of the communities and citizens that could have gone to a consultant. Mr. Ingram stated that there are great folks here at Environmental Services and the Solid Waste District and they do great work every day for our communities. Mr. Ingram then thanked staff.

Mr. Ingram stated that under District contacts on page ii-2, Denise Driehaus needs to be added as the new County Commissioner and the President of the Board of County Commissioners is now Mr. Portune and although this was true in 2016, should be updated.

Mr. Portune and Ms. Christmann thanked Mr. Ingram.

Ms. Christmann stated that staff will make this change but did not think this needed to hold up the Committee adopting the Plan. Mr. Portune asked Ms. Chin if this was correct. She stated that this was correct. Mr. Portune stated that this small of a change did not affect the content of the Plan. Ms. Chin concurred.

Mr. Ingram moved the resolution forward. Mr. Turchiano seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

Mr. Portune stated the schedule of how staff is going to circulate this; where it starts, public meetings, etc. and stated advance work has probably been done anticipating the Committee would act today but really could not finalize anything until the Committee did act. He asked Ms. Christmann when she anticipated that schedule would be finalized and then once it is, asked that she publicize so it will be publically noticed and circulated directly to the Committee.

Ms. Christmann stated that the District is planning on sending the notices to the communities, most likely, February 3.

B. Ohio EPA Grant Applications

Mr. Portune stated that there were several to discuss which were the Market Development Grant, Community Development Grant and Tire Amnesty Grant and asked Ms. Christmann to walk everyone through these.

Ms. Christmann stated that all three of these are Ohio EPA grants and applications are solicited annually.

Ms. Christmann stated that the Market Development Grant has funding available to businesses to improve the recycling infrastructure in Ohio. With this grant, the District is a pass through organization in which Ohio EPA passes the grant money through the District and the District administers the grant to the business if they are funded.

Ms. Christmann stated that the District received one application which was Cleanlites in Forest Park. Cleanlites manages e-waste, some hazardous waste, and they are now looking to expand their operation to be able to accept more air bags for recycling. There are millions of air bag recalls within the last couple of years and this new piece of equipment will allow Cleanlites to be more efficient and be able to expand how many air bags they can de-manufacture and recycle. Ms. Christmann stated that Cleanlites is looking at increasing from 1,200 per year to 8,000 per year.

Ms. Christmann stated that Cleanlites is asking for \$250,000 from Ohio EPA and are matching that with \$612,000 of their own dollars to buy a big kiln to help deactivate the air bags.

Ms. Christmann stated that the District has worked with Cleanlites in the past in reference to market development grants as with Ohio EPA and Cleanlites has met their obligations on the previous grants.

A brief question and answer session ensued.

Ms. Christmann stated that the District is seeking funding through the Community Development Grant to launch the District's wasted food awareness campaign on a much larger level.

Ms. Christmann stated that the District is requesting \$19,317 to do digital advertising on websites that are targeted to families with children and residents roughly 18 – 30, Facebook advertising, and advertising on grocery store carts in grocery stores (as a prompt for people not to buy food they are not going to eat).

Ms. Christmann stated that the District is also doing something completely new which is a pilot project with residents actually weighing how much food they throw away. The City of Seattle, WA in King County and some places in the UK have done really targeted, individualized working with families to show how much food is actually being thrown away. This information will then be publicized to show others how much opportunity there is to save money and reduce food going to the landfill.

A brief discussion and question period ensued regarding how this program would be managed.

Ms. Christmann stated that this grant would not be started until fall, 2017 so the District will take the Committee's points into consideration as this piece of the grant is developed.

Mr. Portune stated that there is a lot of energy on the Committee around this interesting project and the more the Committee can be kept somewhat in the loop and be open to comments and suggestions by members of the Committee please do so. Mr. Portune stated that he believed the Committee would like to see what the final recommended approach is before it goes out to the field.

Ms. Christmann stated that the total project cost is \$19,317 with a grant request of \$10,467 and the District matching \$8,850. Mr. Portune asked if Ms. Christmann thought this would be enough money to do this. Ms. Christmann stated yes. The Plan goes into effect in 2018 and the District has bolstered the advertising budget.

Ms. Christmann stated that the last grant the District is applying for is a continued effort to clean up illegally dumped tires. The District is requesting almost \$14,000 from Ohio EPA with the District matching \$1,500. The District is planning on having tire collection events in about twenty communities ranging from the City of Cincinnati to Colerain Township to Delhi, Green, and Symmes townships.

Ms. Christmann stated that unfortunately, this is an ongoing problem throughout the State. Mr. Ingram stated that staff has the data but might want to use the data of where which townships and municipalities the Health District seems to spend more time in from enforcement and clean-up to see if these communities could be targeted first.

Mr. Ingram stated that this seems to be a state-wide policy question. Ms. Christmann stated that it was. Mr. Ingram stated that every community likes these tire events and nobody likes seeing these tires; they are not only bad for the environment, they are nuisances, they collect water, there are mosquito and other vector problems with them so he is thinking there must be someone who has crafted some suggestions to the legislator saying what needs to be done.

Ms. Christmann stated that this was in the process right now. Ms. Christmann stated that there were a handful of solid waste districts that are working on recommendations for legislative changes and there is a draft list.

Mr. Portune stated that when the work is done on this to please also reach out and plug in local elected leadership for whatever influence can be included whether it be from the County, municipal, township level. They can reach out to the contacts they all have with the state legislators since there is significant desire at that level to address this problem as well.

Mr. Portune asked if there is anything Ms. Christmann was able to share regarding what some of the draft thoughts are as to specific changes that the District is focused on and that other districts around the state are focused on, it might generate some additional suggestions that could prove helpful. Mr. Portune stated this may have been done already. Ms. Christmann stated no but they are in draft right now but on February 2 there is a meeting of all the solid waste districts to review them. After this time, these can be sent out if there are no other changes. Mr. Portune asked if this going to be an in-person meeting. Ms. Christmann stated yes and the meeting will be held in Columbus.

Ms. Magness asked if there were any grants that would help pay for more investigation on this problem because so much money is being spent on clean-up, she feels that a portion should go to prevent it. Ms. Christmann stated that in the Plan Update, which starts in 2018, there will be a full time deputy focused on this as well as other illegal dumping but the primary focus is tires.

Mr. Portune stated that in addition to a deputy enforcing, you have to have attorneys who are willing to prosecute and judges who are willing to hear the cases and asked Ms. Chin if she had any update on this. Ms. Chin stated no and that they have been working with the same group for a couple years now and she thinks one of the biggest issues also is that the enforcement, the penalty phase is an F-5 which is a felony. So, if the person has never really had a record to try and get it to common pleas, the grand jury can come back; and attorneys are going to come back and question why should there be a hearing.

Ms. Christmann stated that she will check and see if changing the charge to a misdemeanor is on the list of recommended legislative changes.

Mr. Portune stated that there can be education, patrol, and enforce but enforcement will have little impact if there is not follow through with prosecution, conviction, and sentence of the people who are violating it and if you do not have the full embrace of those two other necessary arms of the process, it is not going to happen. Ms. Chin stated that it was important to note that letters have been sent to a lot of the car dealerships, and other vendors saying that this is a major problem and tires need to be locked up. Ms. Christmann stated that some of the tires

that are meant for recycling are being stolen by tire scrappers, who are then selling the good ones and dumping the bad.

Mr. Ingram suggested engaging the Ohio Health Commissioners Association because they are going to be interested in this problem to. Ms. Christmann thanked Mr. Ingram for this suggestion.

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if there was anything else on these. Ms. Christmann stated no and staff is recommending approval of all three grants to have County Administrator Jeff Aluotto sign off on them so they can be sent to Ohio EPA.

Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve all three staff recommendations regarding the Ohio EPA grant program. Ms. Magness moved; Mr. Luehrmann seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

C. Presentation – School Food Donation Program

Ms. Christmann she was proud to introduce Ms. Mohring who has worked tirelessly over the past year on reducing food waste in schools and will give a brief presentation about a pilot project that she led at Amity Elementary School to recover and reduce food waste from the school.

Ms. Christmann stated that she hoped Ms. Mohring is as proud as staff is of her on her efforts on this project.

Ms. Mohring's presentation can be found here: <http://bit.ly/2IXEnkJ>

Mr. Portune stated that it was a magnificent result and a very motivational presentation. Mr. Portune stated that the question is if it is that big of an impact at one school, imagine the possibilities at all schools, corporate cafeterias, and other venues where that this is possible.

Mr. Portune stated that he did not know the limitations in the context of what the demands on the Health District and oversight would be. Given those kinds of results, how do we run with this in ways that make it available on a broad base. How does Cincinnati State implement this next week?

Ms. Christmann stated that there were a lot of answers to that question. First, she thanked Hamilton County Public Health, in particular, Greg Kesterman and Jeremy Hessel who were phenomenal in helping the District set this project up.

A brief question, answer, and discussion on barriers to expansion ensued.

Mr. Portune stated that this was a great program and thanked staff for a terrific job out there and their thanks to Amity School. Mr. Portune asked that this message be conveyed to Amity Elementary. As this is moved forward, he wants to make sure that the District continues to acknowledge their good work and being willing to be on the cutting edge on this.

Mr. Portune stated that Ms. Christmann got a lot from the discussion to continue to work up a list of options and next steps and thinks this is one of those things that has great potential. From where he sits, it is something we should get behind in a big way and promote so this will continue to draw attention to what is going to be a great initiative in reducing food waste in the County.

5. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

Mr. Portune stated that there were informational items to either discuss in detail or just simply ask questions about as they all have been presented to members in the advance packets and asked if anyone had questions.

A. 2015 Recycling Rates

Mr. Portune stated that it was good to see that the District continues to exceed the percentages established for both residential and commercial in a significant way.

B. Textile Recycling Efforts

Ms. Christmann stated that Simple Recycling is going to start collecting curbside textiles and household items within the City of Cincinnati beginning March 20 on the resident's regular recycling day. It is free to the City and the City is paid \$20/ton. This is new to southwest Ohio and they are now looking for other communities within Hamilton County to expand to. Ms. Balz has done some outreach to several communities that seem to be interested.

A brief discussion ensued about the program specifics.

C. 2017 Workplan

A brief discussion ensued.

6. TENTATIVE FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

There were no future agenda items at this time.

7. POLICY COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS

There were no Policy Committee Members' comments at this time.

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS

A brief question and answer session ensued regarding wasted food and textile recycling initiatives.

Mr. Portune thanked the Cincinnati State students for attending and their interest.

9. UPCOMING DISTRICT MEETINGS

The next Hamilton County Recycling and Solid Waste Policy Committee meeting will be held on Thursday, March 16, 2017. The meeting will begin at 1:30 p.m. at Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services located at 250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor, Cincinnati, Ohio 45219.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned by acclamation at 2:59 p.m.