

**APPROVED MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF
HAMILTON COUNTY RECYCLING AND SOLID WASTE DISTRICT
POLICY COMMITTEE**

DATE: September 21, 2017

TIME: 1:30 p.m.

PLACE: Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services
250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor
Cincinnati, Ohio 45219

PRESENT: **Policy Committee Members**
Elizabeth Bruggeman, General Interest Member
Tim Ingram, Hamilton County Public Health Representative
Jeff Luehrmann, Generator Representative
Sue Magness, Largest Municipality Representative
Isabella Mazza, Student Representative
Todd Portune, Hamilton County Commissioner, Chair
Larry Riddle, Rumpke
Jeff Ritter, Township Representative, Vice Chair
Tom Turchiano, Public Member

Staff

Michelle Balz, Assistant Solid Waste Manager
Holly Christmann, Director
Joy Landry, Public Relations Specialist
Jenny Lohmann, Program Specialist
Brad Miller, Assistant Director
Cher Mohring, Program Specialist
Susan Schumacher, Assistant Solid Waste Specialist, Clerk

Others in Attendance

Judi Boyko, Assistant County Administrator
Captain Tom , Hamilton County Sheriff's Office
Nee Fong Chin, Hamilton County Prosecutors Office
Chuck DeJonckheeere, Hamilton County Public Health
Brad Dunn, Rumpke Recycling
Katie Evans, Best Way Disposal
Dean Ferrier, Rumpke
Greg Kesterman, Hamilton County Public Health
Rich Simon, Rumpke Recycling

1. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Portune called the meeting to order at 1:33 p.m. and welcomed everyone. Mr. Portune welcomed Isabella Mazza and thanked her for her interest in serving on the Committee.

Mr. Portune introduced Judi Boyko as the new Assistant County Administrator who was in the audience.

2. CLERK'S REPORT

A. Approval of Minutes – July 20, 2017 Policy Committee Meeting

Mr. Portune asked if there were any changes, etc. to the minutes. Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve to July 20, 2017 minutes as drafted. Ms. Bruggeman moved approval. Mr. Ingram seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

B. Additions to the Agenda

Ms. Christmann stated that she was sad to report that Catherine Walsh resigned her position a month ago. Mr. Portune asked, with no objection from the Committee, that Ms. Christmann draft a letter of thanks and commendation on behalf of the Committee to Ms. Walsh.

Ms. Magness asked if Ms. Walsh's position would be filled. Ms. Christmann stated that in the approved Plan, a business position would be added and staff will move forward in posting this position. Currently, staff is rethinking what this position would be but plan to fill it at some point.

3. PRESENTATION BY RUMPKE RECYCLING

Mr. Portune stated that a presentation by of Rumpke Recycling was requested at the last meeting.

Mr. Riddle introduced Mr. Dunn as the Manager/Superintendent at the Material Recovery Facility in St. Bernard.

Mr. Dunn discussed some of the recycling plant challenges with contamination (11.6% which is an increase from the average contamination of 10 – 10.5%) that includes plastic bags, batteries, textiles, scrap metals, syringes, VHS tapes, hoses, etc.

Mr. Dunn discussed the dangers of batteries specifically, lithium ion, and how easily they can ignite and start a fire. Mr. Portune recommended staff provide the Committee with recommendations on how to spread the word about improper disposal of batteries. Ms. Christmann stated yes. Mr. Portune suggested thinking beyond the box of what staff can do through the Solid Waste District and asked staff to think of what the County might be able to do through MSD/water bills in terms of inserts that are mailed to all of the households. It is very important that we do what we can to increase public awareness of what can be recycled and what can't be and where to go with things like batteries. Also to make people conscience of the real and present danger to public safety, property, and life that exists if the wrong things are put into the wrong box.

Mr. Dunn stated that Rumpke Recycling is doing their best to educate people on acceptable items and is hoping for some more support from other organizations such as the District.

Mr. Dunn introduced Rich Simon, Marketing Specialist with the corporate recycling group, and his responsibility is to move all of the container stock material (aluminum cans, plastics, bottles and jugs, etc.) and has a very tight connection with all the buyers and really good industry information.

Mr. Simon discussed the market conditions and the "China Sword" which is China not accepting what they used to and the reasons why. Mr. Simon stressed that this is the reason that only the items on the acceptable item list are accepted.

A question/answer session ensued.

Mr. Portune thanked Mr. Dunn and Mr. Simon for their presentation.

4. DISTRICT REVENUE UPDATES/ANALYSIS

Ms. Christmann stated that revenue is up slightly at \$55,000 compared to the same time last year. Staff is projecting \$2.6 million for 2017. Mr. Riddle stated that the District will see additional revenue this month and next with additional volume of contaminated soil coming in.

A brief discussion ensued regarding sewer sludge.

Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve the revenue report. Mr. Ritter moved. Mr. Turchiano seconded; all were in favor and the motion was approved.

5. POLICY ITEMS

A. Illegal Dumping Program

Mr. Portune stated that the staff recommendation is to take \$104,000 from the carryover balance to underwrite the cost of the program in 2018.

Ms. Christmann stated that as included in the approved Plan, this program funds a full-time Deputy to investigate and enforce illegal dumping primarily focused on tires. Staff met with the Sheriff during the development of the Solid Waste Plan and were told that the cost of the program would be approximately \$100,000. This information was included in the Plan which was approved. As staff was working with the Sheriff's office this summer to finalize the scope of work, staff was informed that there were a few costs missing from that initial estimate including the one-time equipment costs.

Ms. Christmann passed out the new cost estimate sheet to members.

Ms. Christmann stated that the one-time costs include a vehicle, vehicle maintenance, fuel, and the cost of a uniform. In addition, there is a slight increase in salary because this will be a Corporal position and not a Deputy. The Corporal is a higher level position to do more detective type work which is what is needed when investigating these dumping issues.

Ms. Christmann stated that the first year cost included the cost of the Corporal, benefits, etc. plus the one time cost is \$199,000. The year two costs will go down slightly to about \$160,000 because the main increase in cost is the cost of the vehicle, the vehicle build-out, vehicle maintenance, mileage (estimate), and uniform costs. Ms. Christmann stated that staff has been working closely with the Sheriff's office to find ways to reduce costs and gave an example.

Ms. Christmann stated that staff ran the idea of only paying 50 percent or 75 percent of a Deputy's time but the Sheriff's office was very clear that they are not able to subsidize any piece of this program.

Ms. Christmann stated that this is a big change from the District's 2018 budget request as well as what is in the Solid Waste Plan so she wanted to bring it before the Policy Committee to talk through this and answer any questions.

Ms. Christmann stated that she is not happy about the increase in cost, is not happy that staff was told a number two years ago and this is the actual; this is the reality; all the costs were not included in the initial estimate and now they are.

Captain Butler stated that this person would be a new hire and they cannot take from their existing officers because the majority of their services are contracted services already so if someone is promoted for this position, that person would need to be replaced. The uniform is a different type of uniform; it is not what is called a Class A;

it is called a BDU tack tackle uniform because the officer may be required to crawl through the mud, sitting out in deer camps to videotape, etc.

Mr. Portune stated that everyone is trying to cut costs and he knows and wants to acknowledge and respect the Sheriff's desire to keep costs coming out of his budget reduced given the already existing significant budgetary restraints that the Sheriff is facing.

Mr. Portune stated that he would like to try to have a little more work done on the cost with all respect to the Captain. A lot of these items; it is not as if there is only so many radios as there are Deputies on the force, so many coats, holsters, etc. There are things that are bought in bulk with replacements and back-ups, etc.

Mr. Portune stated that the question is what can come with this versus what cannot. He would like to have a little more discussion about this between the District and the department.

Mr. Portune stated that as far as the vehicle goes, he is not sure what type of vehicle this is intended to be and it is not anticipated that the Corporal will be engaged in law enforcement chases or things like that with this program. He is asking because there is a standard of vehicle that ordinarily comes with a Deputy's position that does not necessarily have to come with this program or whether there is some other vehicle in the County that could do the job. The County is constantly replacing vehicles and buying new; sometimes we get trade in allowances and sometimes we do not. Vehicles depreciate and we do not get a lot out of them but we could have a vehicle that is slated to be replaced in the Sheriff's office where, if we get \$28,000 of value of it for this program as opposed to a \$10,000 trade-in value or an \$8,000 trade-in value and it is still serviceable for the work of this program, it would work well and save the District money.

Captain Butler stated that the type of vehicle that was discussed with staff was and is being recommended is an SUV type vehicle because of what is being carried.

Mr. Portune stated that this was fair enough and new Explorers were being bought all the time for the Sheriff's office. Captain Butler stated that he was aware of this and fleet fell under his command right now and \$28,000 - \$29,000 is a bare bones vehicle and to save some money, in speaking with Ms. Christmann, the vehicle would remain unmarked and have a limited lighting package. This vehicle will not routinely be in pursuits or responding to robberies, etc. but if he is in the area, he is expected to and is obligated by law. If he has to stop a vehicle, he has to have emergency lighting packages required by the Ohio Revised Code so there would need to be some lighting and specialized equipment in the new vehicle. It would remain unmarked and would recommend tinting the windows due to surveillance, etc.

Captain Butler stated that they wanted a non-descript vehicle. People are not going to dump if they see a black and gold standard patrol car which is why an unmarked car is being recommended. This saves \$5,000 - \$6,000 on the build out cost because of the light bar, striping, and the other equipment that goes into a regular car so it is substantially less and it is bare bones on this vehicle.

Captain Butler stated that the vehicles that are being traded in as the Committee sees, are only bringing in \$4,000 - \$6,000 for the old Crown Victoria's and the Chargers because of the mileage; mileage is running up to 140,000 miles right now which is practically double what they should be on the street. The Sheriff's office is getting a lot of life but not a lot in trade-in.

Captain Butler stated that the SUV's are getting a better trade-in value at the end. There is a difference between a Chevy Tahoe and a Ford Explorer right now, if a Tahoe was bought and in five years would be traded in, we would get about \$10,000 and if an Explorer was traded in we would get about \$2,000.

Mr. Portune stated that he understood what Captain Butler was saying but his point is rather than trading in a vehicle, if a vehicle would be re-purposed an SUV that would be traded in to this detail, we are getting \$28,000 worth of value versus \$10,000 worth of value for it.

Captain Butler stated that he did not see it that way because now the light bar needs to be removed, the stripes removed which leave an outline, remove cables from the outside, remove the seamount, etc. There will be holes that need to be filled which now compromises the integrity of the vehicle to rust, corrode, etc. from the elements. With a new car, we would not need to worry about this and you still have the warranty on the vehicle from the manufacturer.

Captain Butler stated that if an old car is taken with 80,000 – 90,000 – 100,000 miles on it, there is no warranty. If the transmission goes wrong, that is \$1,800 - \$1,900. Captain Butler stated that with his 28 years of experience here with Columbia Township, they let their cars run too long and there were several cars that had five transmissions put in and the transmission is worth more than the car; they did not have enough money to buy a new car and now they have to.

Mr. Ingram stated that he is committed to seeing that this program goes forward. Captain Butler stated that they are too. Mr. Ingram stated that folks value their assistance in the work they do every day and asked if the \$86,000 was a one-time cost and asked if this was the surprise because the program originally was budgeted at \$104,000 and the one-time cost was not anticipated. Ms. Christmann stated yes. Captain Butler stated that he came into this program late. Captain Butler was promoted in March and did not know who staff was dealing with. Major Corbin and Sheriff Neil asked Captain Butler to step in on this because the traffic unit that is under his command.

Captain Butler stated that staff originally was given just the base numbers of a Deputy's salary and the outfitting, hiring, etc. was not included and the \$86,000 was a one-time fee. Mr. Ingram stated he was just trying to think it through because if we tried to start figuring out if we do this or that, we really should talk about that one-time cost because the salary is set. Captain Butler stated that some of the costs are guesstimates; they do not know how much gas will be used.

Mr. Ingram asked if some of the offenders are caught and they are charged and taken to court, would the District receive any of the settlements that would be awarded back into the District's budget. Captain Butler stated that a judge could order restitution. Ms. Chin asked Mr. Ingram what settlement he was looking for. Ms. Christmann stated that it could be dumping or hauling of tires. Ms. Chin stated sure but when you try and get restitution the reality is it will be squeezing blood out of a turnip and it just may not happen. Mr. Ingram gave an example of how the District could get money back. Captain Butler gave an example of how the Sheriff's office doesn't see money coming back when a patrol car is hit but it can happen and gave an example. Ms. Christmann gave an example of how the District did receive money back from a tire dump clean up.

Mr. Portune stated that as we move forward with this whether restitution is paid or not, it should be a practice to ask for restitution to be part of the orders that are issued. Captain Butler stated that this would be part of their operating procedures and gave an example.

Ms. Bruggeman asked if the Sheriff's office accrues expenses beyond this, would those expenses come back to the District. Ms. Christmann stated that if this is approved, the next phase would be to start developing the memorandum of understanding because the scope of work has already been agreed upon. Staff will work with Ms. Chin and Captain Butler and his team to come up with a memorandum of understanding which will include some of those fine details and also will include a not to exceed amount as typical with County contracts. Ms. Bruggeman stated that Captain Butler mentioned surveillance equipment. Captain Butler stated that this was some of the

equipment and the Sheriff's office has some that can be used and some of that was built in. They have this in the majority of their contracts that currently exist and if it reaches a point that the District would need to be contacted before any more money is spent they would.

Ms. Christmann stated just for clarification, the District is working closely with Keep Cincinnati Beautiful who has a lot of deer cameras and when this program was initially being developed, they said we could coordinate where those are placed with the Sheriff's office.

Ms. Chin stated that regarding the vehicle, if this program ends within the next year or two, the vehicle would come back to the District or we would obtain something for buying the vehicle. Mr. Portune stated that if the District is buying it, it would remain with the Solid Waste District.

Mr. Portune stated that Staff has recommended the excess amount is taken from the carryover balance for the illegal dumping program in 2018 upon the discussion and this being a one-time cost would recommend that the Committee approve the recommendation so unless there is objection asked to receive a motion to approve. Ms. Christmann stated that the one-time cost is the \$86,000 but there will be fuel costs in future years as well so it won't go down to exactly \$117,757.00.

Mr. Ingram moved approve. Ms. Magness seconded. Mr. Portune asked for further discussion; hearing none, asked that all in favor to please indicate by saying aye. All but one of the Committee stated aye. Mr. Portune asked for an opposed aye. Mr. Ritter stated nay. Mr. Portune stated that by majority vote, the motion carries.

B. Reuse Conference Sponsorship

Mr. Portune stated that ReuseConex is the biennial conference of the Reuse Institute, a nonprofit organization dedicated to increasing awareness of reuse through educational events, etc. and are interested in conducting their 2018 conference in Hamilton County and asked the District to consider financial sponsorship and in-kind support.

Mr. Portune stated that personally, he thinks it is important as staff attend conferences around the state and receive the benefit of those who host them that it is appropriate for the District as well to be involved in hosting.

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if the amount being requested was in line with sponsorship costs that are, with respect to other conferences by this institute. Ms. Christmann stated that this conference was not just a state-wide but an international organization that has had conferences in Boston, Austin, and Portland over the last three conferences they have had so we are in good company and was honored that they are picking Hamilton County. For \$7,500 the District would be listed as a co-host of the event with five free admissions, recognition on all their literature, website, etc.

Mr. Portune asked if Ms. Christmann has gone to one of these conferences. Ms. Christmann stated no but Catherine Walsh went to the last one in Boston and came back rejuvenated and had nothing but amazing things to say about the conference.

Mr. Portune asked if the District used the benefit of Ms. Walsh's attendance in any identifiable way since she went there. Ms. Christmann stated that staff has been doing more of a focus on reuse because it is higher on the food chain than recycling.

Mr. Portune stated that based on the discussion with Rumpke earlier about getting the word out on different things that the District could parlay this into a public awareness campaign around reuse and recycling as well. Ms. Christmann stated that the District has a lot of public awareness campaigns starting next year so maybe push the reuse to 2019. Ms. Christmann stated that the District did a reuse campaign in 2016.

Mr. Portune stated that their conference is next year and given the fact that there are a lot of things we need to do and can do asked Ms. Christmann if she envisioned that there is a way that hosting this conference fits into the District's plans of providing a greater awareness. Ms. Christmann stated yes.

A brief discussion ensued.

Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve. Mr. Ritter moved; Ms. Magness seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

6. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

Mr. Portune asked if there were any questions about the informational items and if so, raise those with Ms. Christmann after the meeting because he had to leave but stated that Mr. Ritter could carry the meeting forward if the Committee wanted to have a longer discussion and asked if this was acceptable to everyone. The Committee concurred to accept the informational items as presented.

7. TENTATIVE FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

There were no tentative future agenda items at this time.

8. POLICY COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS

Ms. Bruggeman stated that she wanted to commend Ms. Mohring and Ms. Lohmann and the team on the food sharing program and officially announce that Sycamore Community Schools is doing food sharing district wide. Ms. Bruggeman received a round of applause.

9. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments at this time.

10. UPCOMING DISTRICT MEETINGS

The next Hamilton County Recycling and Solid Waste Policy Committee meeting will be held on Thursday, November 16, 2017. The meeting will begin at 1:30 p.m. at Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services located at 250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor, Cincinnati, Ohio 45219.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Portune asked for a motion to adjourn. Mr. Ritter moved; Mr. Ingram seconded. Mr. Portune stated that by rising vote, the meeting was adjourned at 2:40 p.m.