

**APPROVED MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF
HAMILTON COUNTY RECYCLING AND SOLID WASTE DISTRICT
POLICY COMMITTEE
November 17, 2016**

DATE: November 17, 2016

TIME: 1:30 p.m.

PLACE: Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services
250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor
Cincinnati, Ohio 45219

PRESENT: **Policy Committee Members**

Elizabeth Bruggeman, General Interest Member
Tim Ingram, Hamilton County Public Health Representative
Jeff Luehrmann, Generator Representative
Sue Magness, Largest Municipality Representative
Todd Portune, County Commissioner, Chair
Larry Riddle, Ex-Officio Member
Jeff Ritter, Township Representative
Tom Turchiano, Public Member
Lilly Witte, Student Representative

Staff

Michelle Balz, Assistant Solid Waste Manager
Holly Christmann, Director
Charlie Gonzalez, Solid Waste Intern
Ali Khodadad, Operations Manager
Jenny Lohmann, Program Specialist
Brad Miller, Assistant Director
Cher Mohring, Program Specialist
Susan Schumacher, Assistant Solid Waste Specialist, Clerk
Catherine Walsh, Business Outreach Coordinator

Others in Attendance

Nee Fong Chin, Hamilton County Prosecutor's Office
Chuck DeJonckheere, Hamilton County Public Health
Suzy DeYoung, La Soupe
Dean Ferrier, Rumpke
Mary Huttlinger, Keep Cincinnati Beautiful
Greg Kesterman, Hamilton County Public Health
Ann Witte, Resident

1. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Portune called the meeting to order at 1:35 p.m. Mr. Portune acknowledged and welcomed Mr. Ritter to the meeting.

2. CLERK'S REPORT

A. Approval of Minutes – July 21, 2016 Policy Committee Meeting

Mr. Portune asked if there were any questions or comments on the minutes as drafted and circulated. Hearing none, entertained a motion to approve the July 21, 2016 minutes as drafted. Ms. Magness moved approval; Ms. Bruggeman seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

B. Additions to the Agenda

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if there were any additions to the agenda. Ms. Christmann stated that she wanted to provide an update on the changes to the litter collection program the next year.

Mr. Portune stated that this item related to the inmate litter patrol program that has been in place for the past nine years where inmates from the Justice Center will pick up litter in eight city neighborhoods and eight political jurisdictions outside the City on an annual basis. Mr. Ritter asked if Colerain Avenue would be in the scope of this program. Ms. Christmann stated that Colerain Avenue would be included. Ms. Balz stated that the community chooses where the litter should be picked up. Mr. Portune stated that Colerain Township would not be a constant community and that it rotates from year to year.

Ms. Christmann stated that this program is not included in the Plan Update which will begin in 2018. Ms. Christmann stated that the District partners with the City of Cincinnati, the Hamilton County Sheriff's Department and Keep Cincinnati Beautiful (KCB).

Ms. Christmann stated that the District cost-shares one deputy with the City of Cincinnati and the City is no longer providing that extra funding to fund one, full-time deputy. The City is still funding deputies for projects they have in the City but not for this one.

Ms. Christmann stated that the Sheriff's department informed the District they could not devote a part-time deputy to this program. KCB recommended to the District to use a company called "Lawn Life" who is a landscaping/home improvement company that KCB has used for other projects. Lawn Life's mission statement is to provide disconnected youth with opportunities to gain real work experience. Lawn Life will now take on the litter collection through the end of 2017.

Ms. Christmann stated that she wanted to commend KCB for finding a solution. When the Solid Waste Plan Update goes into effect in 2018, the District will fund a full-time deputy to enforce illegal dumping as opposed to collecting litter.

Mr. Ritter asked if Residential Recycling Incentive (RRI) dollars could be used to hire a deputy, part-time to pay for this program in Colerain Township. Ms. Christmann stated that litter collection is now an allowable use for the RRI program.

Mr. Portune stated that the litter collection program is a little bit inconsistent with the mission of the District which to reduce reliance on the landfill but now that litter collection is a permissible expenditure, there is a year under this new approach and he will still say that it remains a popular program in the communities and while it is not in the Plan Update, communities might want to revisit with RRI money.

Mr. Portune stated that the annual awards breakfast of the District was on Tuesday morning at the Centennial Barn which was a terrific facility. The breakfast, care of La Soupe, was terrific and congratulations again to all of the award winners whose stories were outstanding.

Mr. Portune stated that staff did a terrific job. Mr. Ingram complemented staff as well and stated that the food was great.

3. DISTRICT REVENUE UPDATES/ANALYSIS

Ms. Christmann stated that Attachment B showed revenue through September 2016 compared to September 2015 and it has increased by about \$340,000. Revenue is projected at \$2.6 million for 2016.

Mr. Portune asked Mr. Riddle if the District was going to stay at this level of collection. Mr. Riddle stated that it should continue. One of the reasons for the increase was a good bit of waste was diverted out of Montgomery County which came to Rumpke at the out-of-district fee of \$2.00/ton. When Rumpke came to an agreement with Colerain

Township on the expansion, that volume was moved back in which is about 700 tons/day which the major part of that increase and Rumpke expects this to maintain.

Mr. Portune stated that some of the District's "belt tightening" predictions can be loosened a little bit with respect to programs that the Committee supported but were not necessarily going to continue. From the standpoint of the District and the programming through here, this is good news in terms of getting to a zero waste producing community. Ms. Christmann stated that the District is still working towards that vision.

Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve the revenue report. Mr. Ingram moved; Mr. Ritter seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

4. POLICY ITEMS

A. Nomination of Vice-Chair

Mr. Portune stated that the Committee has the ability to nominate someone and the former Vice-Chair was Commissioner Deters. Mr. Portune asked if the Committee wanted to entertain the submission of names for nomination or follow tradition in terms of the past and stated that he did not have a preference. Ms. Christmann stated that she would recommend that the Vice-Chair be one of the statutory members which would be Trustee Ritter, Commissioner Ingram, or Ms. Magness.

Mr. Ingram stated that traditionally the Committee has always had Vice-Chairs as the Township Trustee so he would defer unless Ms. Magness would want it, would love to see Trustee Ritter as the Vice-Chair. Mr. Ritter stated he would be delighted.

Mr. Ingram moved that Mr. Ritter become Vice-Chair of the Policy Committee. Ms. Bruggeman seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

B. Extension of Public Member's Term

Mr. Portune stated that Mr. Turchiano currently serves as the public member. Mr. Portune stated that he understands that Mr. Turchiano would like to continue to serve and Mr. Turchiano agreed. Mr. Portune asked if there was any discussion.

Ms. Christmann stated that she appreciated Mr. Turchiano offering to extend his term as staff is still finalizing the approval of the Plan Update. Ms. Christmann stated she thought it was great to have a person in this position who has been involved in the Plan Update since the beginning.

Mr. Ingram stated that Mr. Turchiano also served on the Finance Subcommittee regarding a potential fee increase which was a crucial time.

Mr. Portune stated that the other option was to appoint someone else and he believes that given the issues in front of the Committee and the activities that still need to be done, he thinks there is a lot to be said for continuity and retaining that experience. Beyond that, Mr. Turchiano has been a good member and contributed very well.

Mr. Portune stated that unless there is objection to this, he would suggest the Committee extend the term and reappoint Mr. Turchiano as the public member for an additional two year term. Mr. Ritter moved; Mr. Luehrmann seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

C. Motion Correction from July Meeting

Ms. Christmann stated that at the July meeting when the draft Plan Update was being approved, there was a motion to add language about the anaerobic digestion which was added, however, in looking back at the Plan Update page numbers, the motion included the incorrect page numbers.

Ms. Christmann stated that she spoke with Commissioner Portune after that meeting and decided to have that motion be corrected at this meeting which is to change the language in the Plan Update to pages 19 – 20 in Chapter 4 and E6. The original motion mentioned G3 and the language is not mentioned in G3.

Mr. Portune stated the he will entertain a motion to correct the action as reflected. Ms. Magness moved; Mr. Turchiano seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

D. Solid Waste Management Plan Update

Ms. Christmann stated that a public hearing was held at 1:00 pm today for public comments, which none were received. However, the District did receive a comment from Ohio EPA during the public comment period of an oversight that Ohio EPA did not catch initially. In the format on how to write a solid waste plan, Ohio EPA did not include some language that was required per the Ohio Revised Code which was an oversight on Ohio EPA's part and this has since been corrected. Ms. Christmann summarized Ohio EPA's comments.

Mr. Portune stated that a motion will be entertained to amend the Solid Waste Management Plan as discussed. Mr. Ritter moved; Ms. Bruggeman seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

E. 2017 District Priority Grant

Mr. Portune stated that the District Priority Grant for communities and non-profit organizations, identifies three key solid waste management issues eligible for grant funding and applicants may submit to receive a grant that addresses those issues.

Mr. Portune stated that the grant recommendations are that the Committee approves the grant award and recommendations. Mr. Portune stated that there are two grant requests that exceed \$15,000 and those are the ones that require action by the Committee and those are Keep Cincinnati Beautiful (KCB) and La Soupe.

Mr. Portune asked Ms. Christmann if she would like to elaborate. Ms. Christmann stated that this grant year was very competitive and there was a great internal committee to review the grant applications to base the decisions on very strict criteria so unfortunately, there were some applications that could not be funded based on the ranking and criteria.

Ms. Christmann stated that the two grant applications over \$15,000 that the District is recommending for approval are La Soupe and KCB.

Ms. Christmann stated that La Soupe wants to purchase and install a refrigerator and freezer so more produce can be rescued and make more food to feed hungry people. La Soupe will also provide produce to pantries. La Soupe is requesting \$25,700, will divert over 70 tons, and will provide over 160,000 meals per year with this rescued wasted food.

Ms. Christmann stated that KCB is requesting \$15,500 to focus on waste reduction by purchasing reusable water bottles and jugs of water as filling stations for their volunteers. An incredible amount of education and marketing to their volunteers about the waste reduction and the reuse of these bottles will be done.

Ms. Christmann stated that the grant committee was thrilled to see the strong marketing and education component with this grant and the District fully supports approval of both grant applications.

Ms. Christmann stated that KCB and La Soupe are here to answer any questions the Committee may have.

Mr. Riddle asked how the Committee and District would know how \$15,000 worth of water bottles are really going to be reused more than one time and gave an example. Ms. Christmann stated that they are providing incentives to their volunteers to bring them back to future events and also the strong marketing campaign to bring them back.

Ms. Huttlinger stated that the educational component was an important component of this campaign. KCB tries to use every opportunity or interface with their 17,000 volunteers to really stress that they wouldn't have to be out cleaning up litter if they took care of business and if people were more responsible about the types of containers they used for drinking water.

Ms. Huttlinger stated that KCB is also planning to provide factoids about recycling and the impacts with the hope being that not only verbal communication but the information that is on the water bottle itself. KCB really struggled internally about what type of water bottle to go with and gave examples. KCB wanted to go with a responsibly-made container that supported a locally owned and operated business and one KCB felt people would like to use; that it was visually appealing, could be used for hot or cold beverages, and that it was something that would last. Ms. Huttlinger stated that KCB actually had a focus group on water bottles.

Ms. Huttlinger stated that KCB found a locally sourced water bottle company and decided to use them as part of this grant and went with what the findings of their focus group told them.

Mr. Riddle asked how much of the total was for education versus the bottles. Ms. Huttlinger stated that part of KCB's whole operating budget is continuing education so anytime they have opportunity to speak with their volunteers, their stakeholder groups, kids they work with, etc. they always try and fold in an educational opportunity.

Ms. Huttlinger stated that it is really hard to put a finite number on that because once KCB gets people in their fold, email, etc. not only do they hear about it in person, they get email follow-ups. A lot of KCB's volunteers are repeat volunteers so KCB reiterates the educational component to them as well.

Mr. Riddle asked if all of the \$15,500 was going towards bottles. Ms. Huttlinger stated yes and that KCB was matching that with another \$10,700 and KCB is absorbing the marketing cost; about 98% is going towards bottles of the match.

Ms. Magness suggested that KCB have a return station at their events for the bottles. Ms. Magness also stated that she would not limit the selection of bottles to just brand new ones; reuse stores such as St. Vincent has hundreds of them that could be purchased.

Ms. Christmann stated that KCB expects almost 10,000 of the single serve-water bottles not being used which is a huge waste reduction. Ms. Huttlinger stated to Ms. Magness that this was something that they have talked about in part of the strategy, in addition to education and communicating with their volunteers, is instead of just trying to get people to show up to events to work is to bring your water bottle. KCB has been seeing that people love to wear their t-shirts from prior years so KCB hopes to have consecutive themes for the water bottles so that it becomes an incentive to bring back your water bottle, you get a hat, t-shirt, etc. and if you don't have a water bottle then you don't bring it back.

Ms. Huttlinger stated that KCB is trying to build a diverse kind of strategy, again with the focus group, to make sure that there are incentives so that people do bring it back but also out of the gate people know to bring their water bottle to the event and there will be incentives as well.

Mr. Portune stated that usually at events like this, volunteers are supported with some sort of snack including water and asked if it was KCB's intent to, rather than hand out bottled water, to hand out filled or fillable water bottles. Ms. Huttlinger stated yes. Mr. Portune asked whether there will be no bottled water would be handed out. Ms. Huttlinger stated that is the route KCB would like to go. KCB's dream is not to have to partner with an organization to receive donations of single use water bottles but to partner with Water Works or the big 5 gallon containers that have the hand pump to have those available to people.

Mr. Portune stated the grant recipients that do not require a vote are the Flying Pig Marathon, Cincinnati Recreation Commission, Mercy Montessori Center, and St. Ursula Academy.

Mr. Portune asked if there was any pushback from the applicants that were not recommended for funding. Ms. Christmann stated that it was one of the most competitive grant years staff has seen in quite some time. There were a couple of applications that were close, i.e. City of Loveland, Colerain Township, etc. There were some that would not have been funded even if there was unlimited funding because of the quality of the application.

Ms. Christmann stated that the Committee used a very strong ranking and criteria and there was a cross section of Environmental Services employees. The committee did a very good, hard job of deciding which ones should be funded based on staff's criteria.

Mr. Portune entertained a motion to approve the staff recommendations for the District Priority Grants. Mr. Turchiano motioned to approve the staff recommendation for the District Priority Grants. Mr. Ritter seconded. All were in favor and the motion was approved.

5. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

A. SWANA – Ohio Buckeye Chapter Young Professional Award

Ms. Christmann stated that she was thrilled to announce that Ms. Balz was named the Young Professional of the Year by the Solid Waste Association of North America – Ohio Chapter. The Committee applauded and congratulated Ms. Balz.

B. Southwest Ohio Pollution Prevention Internship Results

Ms. Christmann stated that the Southwest Ohio Pollution Prevention Internship program is a regional program which includes Hamilton, Butler, and Montgomery counties who come together to identify one – two companies in their county that could use the help of an intern over the summer who are trained by experts to look at ways for these industries to reduce waste and save money.

Ms. Christmann stated that Ms. Walsh has led this program and it has been extremely successful. The most recent company in Hamilton County was Patheon, Inc. who also received an award at the awards ceremony a few days ago.

Ms. Christmann stated that Patheon did a couple of waste reduction projects that will save them almost \$54,000 per year.

Ms. Christmann stated that one project was reusable cups and the other was reducing a packaging material and reducing cardboard.

Ms. Christmann congratulated Ms. Walsh for all her efforts and work on this program.

C. 3rd Quarter Performance Measures

Ms. Christmann stated that most programs are on track to meet or exceed their goals for the year. Ms. Christmann summarized some of the highlights: 8,400 tires were collected, 36 offices and 19 bars and restaurants started recycling programs year to date, and 17 schools have started or expanded recycling programs.

Ms. Christmann stated this was a great job by everyone on the team. The Committee congratulated staff on a good job.

6. TENTATIVE FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

Solid Waste Management Plan Update approval and an update on wasted food initiatives.

7. POLICY COMMITTEE MEMBERS' COMMENTS

Mr. Ingram requested the 2017 Policy Committee dates be forwarded to members.

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments at this time.

9. UPCOMING DISTRICT MEETINGS

The next Hamilton County Recycling and Solid Waste Policy Committee meeting will be held on Thursday, January 19, 2017. The meeting will begin at 1:30 p.m. at Hamilton County Department of Environmental Services located at 250 William Howard Taft Road - First Floor, Cincinnati, Ohio 45219.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned by acclamation at 2:18 p.m.